

Case Report Grading sheet

	4 pts	3 pts	2 pts	1 pt	0 pts
Title	Title accurately describes the contents of the case report		Title somewhat describes the contents of the case report		Title does not accurately describe the contents of the case report
Introduction of topic	Provides a complete overview of the general concept of the paper (~ 1 paragraph)	Mostly complete overview of the general concept of the paper (~ 1 paragraph)	Somewhat complete overview of the general concept of the paper (may be more than ~ 1 paragraph)	Section is an incomplete overview of the general concept of the paper (may be more than ~ 1 paragraph)	Intro is missing or does not provide an overview of the general concept of the paper
Literature review	Literature cited is current and high quality. No more than 3 top clinical problems are stated. Complete, concise, and thorough description provided for pathophysiology, typical history and presentation, differential diagnoses, and diagnostic approach for each clinical problem. Includes complete synopsis of the treatment and management options for the clinical problem or diagnosis, and current recommended therapies/procedures. Expected outcome and prognosis is discussed.	Literature cited is mostly current and high quality. No more than 3 top clinical problems are stated. Mostly complete, concise, and thorough description provided for pathophysiology, typical history and presentation, differential diagnoses, and diagnostic approach for each clinical problem. Mostly complete synopsis of the treatment and management options for the clinical problem or diagnosis, and current recommended therapies/procedures. Expected outcome and prognosis is discussed. 1-2 significant omissions.	Literature cited is somewhat current and is of moderate quality. There may be more than 3 top clinical problems stated. Somewhat complete, concise, and thorough description provided for pathophysiology, typical history and presentation, differential diagnoses, and diagnostic approach for each clinical problem. Somewhat complete synopsis of the treatment and management options for the clinical problem or diagnosis, and current recommended therapies/procedures. Expected outcome and prognosis may not be discussed fully. More than 2 significant omissions.	Literature cited is not current and is of moderate to low quality. More than 3 top clinical problems may be stated. Description of pathophysiology, typical history and presentation, differential diagnoses, and diagnostic approach for each clinical problem is not complete, concise or thorough. Incomplete synopsis of the treatment and management options for the clinical problem or diagnosis, and current recommended therapies/procedures. Expected outcome and prognosis is poorly discussed. Many significant omissions.	Literature cited is not current and is of low quality and incomplete for the problems discussed. May have more than 3 top clinical problems stated. Does not include complete, concise, or thorough description of the pathophysiology, typical history and presentation, differential diagnoses, and diagnostic approach for each clinical problem. Does not include complete synopsis of the treatment and management options for the clinical problem or diagnosis or current recommended therapies/procedures. Expected outcome and prognosis is not discussed.

Case report	Complete description of the patient or population, the chief complaint, and relevant history and clinical findings. All relevant procedures, medications, complications, co-morbidities, and justification for deviations from standard procedures are discussed. Outcome includes patient or case outcome, results of clinical procedures or medical management, and full follow up of the case.	Mostly complete description of the patient or population, the chief complaint, and relevant history and clinical findings. Most relevant procedures, medications, complications, co-morbidities, and justification for deviations from standard procedures are discussed. Outcome includes most of the information for patient or case outcome, results of clinical procedures or medical management, and full follow up of the case. 1-2 significant omissions present	Somewhat complete description of the patient or population, the chief complaint, and relevant history and clinical findings. Some of the relevant procedures, medications, complications, co-morbidities, and justification for deviations from standard procedures are discussed. Outcome includes some of the patient or case outcome, results of clinical procedures or medical management, with partial follow up of the case. More than 2 significant omissions	Minimal description of the patient or population, the chief complaint, and relevant history and clinical findings. Few relevant procedures, medications, complications, co-morbidities, and justification for deviations from standard procedures are discussed. Minimal discussion of patient or case outcome, results of clinical procedures or medical management, with minimal follow up of the case. Many significant omissions.	Description of the patient or population, the chief complaint, and relevant history and clinical findings are incomplete or missing. Relevant procedures, medications, complications, co-morbidities, or justification for deviations from standard procedures are incomplete or missing. Case outcome, results of clinical procedures, medical management, and case follow-up are incomplete or missing.
Discussion and critique	Complete constructive evaluation of case deficiencies, mistakes, and/or complications. Able to identify potential changes to be made in future cases. Demonstrates ability to learn from an imperfect case. New material has not been added.	Mostly complete constructive evaluation of case deficiencies, mistakes, and/or complications. Able to identify potential changes to be made in future cases. Demonstrates ability to learn from an imperfect case. Minimal new material may have been added. 1-2 significant omissions present.	Somewhat complete constructive evaluation of case deficiencies, mistakes, and/or complications. Moderate ability to identify potential changes to be made in future cases. Demonstrates some ability to learn from an imperfect case. New material may have been added. More than 2 significant omissions present.	Minimal constructive evaluation of case deficiencies, mistakes, and/or complications. Minimal changes discussed for future cases. Minimal demonstration of ability to learn from an imperfect case. Significant new material may have been added. Many significant omissions present.	Does not critically evaluate case deficiencies, mistakes, and/or complications. Unable to identify potential changes to be made in future cases. Does not demonstrate ability to learn from an imperfect case. Significant new material has been added.
Endnotes	Endnotes are present and properly cited for all appropriate items		Endnotes are mostly present and properly cited for all appropriate items		Endnotes are not present and/or are improperly cited for appropriate items

References	References are current, applicable, and comprehensive for all problems identified and discussed	Most relevant and current applicable references are cited	References are listed, but more current, applicable, or specific references are available	Includes very few relevant references for the topics of discussion	References are inappropriate or incomplete for the topics of discussion
Labs	Lab results presented in the report are relevant to the case and are clearly displayed and described in the case report.		Lab results are present in the report, but are not entirely relevant to the case or could be more clearly displayed or described in the case report.		Lab results are missing OR results are not relevant to the case OR are illegible without description in the case report.
Overall Impression Sections – PASS/FAIL					
Overall impressions A	This case report demonstrates case management commensurate with an ABVP diplomate level of practice.				This case report does not demonstrate case management commensurate with an ABVP diplomate level of practice.
Overall impressions B	Case report effectively demonstrates applicant's clinical acumen, expertise and ability to thoroughly work-up a case and follow it from beginning to end. Overall structure and presentation of the document has minimal organizational, grammatical or spelling errors and is of professional quality.				Case report does not effectively demonstrate applicant's clinical acumen, expertise and ability to thoroughly work-up a case and follow it from beginning to end. Overall structure and presentation of the document has multiple, significant organizational, grammatical or spelling errors and is not of professional quality.

Case Report Scoring Chart

Section	Weighted percent	Points awarded (0-4)	Total points (points X section weight)	Total possible points for section
Title	5			20
Introduction of topic	7.5			30
Literature review	20			80
Case report	30			120
Discussion and critiques	25			100
Endnotes	5			20
References	7.5			30
Labs/tables	5			20
Overall Impression Sections & Word Count – PASS/FAIL				
Overall Impressions A	Yes/No		Need a YES in this section or entire CR does not pass	
Overall Impressions B	Yes/No		Need a YES in this section or entire CR does not pass	
Total Word Count does not exceed 19,000 words	Yes/No		Need a YES in this section or entire CR does not pass	
Formatting Requirements				
<u>Formatting Criteria</u> 1. PDF file format 2. Times, Arial, Calibri, or Helvetica font; size 11 or 12 3. Labs, Tables & Figures located in chronological order in a section at the end of the paper	Yes/No		A 5-point deduction to the overall score of the case will be assessed for <u>each</u> formatting criteria that does not meet requirements	
		*Any sections marked "0" will fail the paper		420

Requirements for a case report to pass:

- 1) Minimum score of 70% (294 out of 420 points)
- 2) No individually graded section received a score of “0”
- 3) Both overall impressions sections (A & B) received a “Yes”
- 4) Total document word count cannot exceed 19,000 words (does not include references, endnotes or tables)